

Private Peers – What Role Should Privacy Law Play in Learning the Identities of P2P Users? The European Case

**Sixteenth Annual Conference
Intellectual Property Law & Policy**

Fordham Intellectual Property Law Institute

March 27 and 28, 2008

Dr. Volker Kitz LL.M. (New York University)

Division Intellectual Property and Competition Law

**Max Planck Institute for Intellectual Property, Competition and
Tax Law**

**Attorney at Law (Germany)
kitz@hoecker.eu**



MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT



From IP Address to IP Enforcement

- Three preconditions for learning a user's identity from his dynamic IP address:
 - Dynamic IP address must have been stored by provider.
 - Until recently: Permanent storage **prohibited** by privacy law (Art. 6 (2) of European Directive 2002/58, "Privacy and Electronic Communications Directive").
 - Since September 15, 2007: **Obligation** to store IP addresses (Art. 5 of European Directive 2006/24, "Data Retention Directive").
 - Provider must be obliged to give data to right holder.
 - Disclosure of identity may be ordered (Art. 8 (1) of Directive 2004/48, "IP Enforcement Directive").
 - Privacy law must allow provider to use data for disclosure.

Dr. Volker Kitz
LL.M. (NYU)

Division Intellectual Property
and Competition Law
Max Planck Institute
for Intellectual Property,
Competition and Tax Law

Attorney at Law
(Germany)



MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT

From IP Address to IP Enforcement

- Can privacy law prevail over IP enforcement?
 - ECJ: Yes, it can.
 - Within discretion of Member States to strike balance between IP protection and privacy.

Dr. Volker Kitz
LL.M. (NYU)

Division Intellectual Property
and Competition Law
Max Planck Institute
for Intellectual Property,
Competition and Tax Law

Attorney at Law
(Germany)

The “No, No, Never” Approach – a Right Balance?

- Some Member States generally prohibit the use of IP addresses for private law enforcement.

- Good for privacy, but bad for
 - IP enforcement:
Enforcement Directive ineffective in Internet cases.
 - Legal awareness of Internet users:
No individual litigation, no sense for right and wrong.



MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT

Dr. Volker Kitz
LL.M. (NYU)

Division Intellectual Property
and Competition Law
Max Planck Institute
for Intellectual Property,
Competition and Tax Law

Attorney at Law
(Germany)

The “Provider Does It All” Approach – a Right Balance?

- Current debate about filtering and blocking obligations for access providers.

- Seems inadequate because
 - more conflicts between more parties
 - new privacy issues with regard to monitoring traffic
 - undue burden on access providers



MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT

Dr. Volker Kitz
LL.M. (NYU)

Division Intellectual Property
and Competition Law
Max Planck Institute
for Intellectual Property,
Competition and Tax Law

Attorney at Law
(Germany)



MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT

Proposal for a Two-Tiered System

- First stage (first-time infringers):
Provider does not disclose user's identity yet, but must send warning notice to user.
 - High level of privacy maintained at first.
 - Helps raise legal awareness of user.
 - Helps right holder, as most infringers stop if once caught.

- Second stage (repeated infringements):
Provider must disclose user identity to right holder.
Conflict must now be settled between the parties involved.

Dr. Volker Kitz
LL.M. (NYU)

Division Intellectual Property
and Competition Law
Max Planck Institute
for Intellectual Property,
Competition and Tax Law

Attorney at Law
(Germany)

Thank You for Your Attention

Dr. Volker Kitz LL.M. (New York University)

Senior Researcher, Max Planck Institute, Munich

Attorney at Law (Germany)

kitz@hoecker.eu

www.drkitz.de



MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT

**Dr. Volker Kitz
LL.M. (NYU)**

Division Intellectual Property
and Competition Law
**Max Planck Institute
for Intellectual Property,
Competition and Tax Law**

**Attorney at Law
(Germany)**



MAX-PLANCK-GESELLSCHAFT

Dr. Volker Kitz
LL.M. (NYU)

Division Intellectual Property
and Competition Law
Max Planck Institute
for Intellectual Property,
Competition and Tax Law

Attorney at Law
(Germany)